

4. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter discusses the findings of the writer’s research. Section 4.1 discusses the translation strategies used in the Indonesian version of the We Love Disney album. Section 4.2 discusses the suitability of the chosen translation strategies in terms of meaning and form.

4.1 Translation Strategies in the Translation of the English Songs from the We Love *Disney* Album into the Indonesian Version

This chapter analyzes the translation strategies employed in the translation of 12 English songs from the We Love Disney album into the Indonesian version. The writer used Baker’s (2018) translation strategies for the analysis. The translation strategies that the writer discusses are translation strategies using general word, neutral or less expressive word, cultural substitution, loan word, paraphrase using related word, paraphrase using unrelated word, and omission.

4.1.1 Translation by a More General Word

Translation by a more general word is one of the most used translation strategies. This strategy works in most languages because the structure of the semantic is “not language-specific” (Baker, 2018, p. 25). The writer found some choruses in the Indonesian version of the We Love Disney album that employed this strategy. Below are some examples from the data:

Table 4.1

First example of Translation by a More General Word

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G	
2.2	Or asked the grinning bobcat why he grinned?	Mengerti kala hewan tersenyum	V				V		V	The word “grinning bobcat” was changed to “hewan”

‘Grinning bobcat’ refers to a cat with a wide smile. The existence of bobcats itself is not common. Their most common habitat is in the forest. Most Indonesians will not be familiar with this animal. In this example, ‘bobcat’ was translated into ‘hewan’, which means ‘animal’. A more general

word for the animal was used not only for familiarity purposes, but also to fit the original syllables of the line.

Table 4.2

Second example of Translation by a More General Word

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes	
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G		
9.4	Up on the shore, they work all day	Di darat kerja seharian	V							V	“Shore” was not translated to “tepi pantai”, which would be closer in meaning.

‘Shore’ has a few different equivalences in Indonesian. It can be translated as “tepi pantai”, “darat”, or “daratan”. In this context, the closest meaning to “shore” is “tepi pantai” because the title of the ninth song is Under the Sea. However, the translator used ‘darat’ to convey the meaning of ‘shore’. This decision was mainly based on form consideration, because if the translator had opted for “tepi pantai”, the translation would not fit the syllables of the English lyrics.

4.1.2 Translation by a More Neutral/Less Expressive Word

This translation strategy was used in the process of translating the English version of We Love Disney album into the Indonesian version when the terms in the lyrics were too explicit or extremely expressive. The translator changed the terms to more general terms in the TL to maintain the original meaning and consider the target audience of Disney, which is children. There are some lyrics in the chorus of the Indonesian version that employed translation by more neutral/less expressive word. Below are some examples from the data:

Table 4.3

First Example of Translation by More Neutral/Less Expressive Word

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes	
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G		
3.1	No matter how your heart is grieving	Tak akan terhindari lelah		V						V	The word "grieving" here expresses negative feelings.

The word 'grieving' can be used in different kinds of situations in the SL. Depending on the context, the word can be used to express loneliness, sadness, or mourning over death. However, the term 'grieving' in the TL is mainly used to refer to the death of a person. In Indonesia, the meaning of 'grieving' is 'berduka'. Indonesians use this word to describe the act of mourning over someone's death. However, the translator used "lelah" to express the meaning in the SL after considering the context of the third song. In the third song, the highlight of the song is about someone who hopes to achieve their dreams. When a person is hoping to achieve their dreams, s/he can feel tired or be at their wit's end. Therefore, this particular strategy was used to make the translation fit the overall context of the song.

Table 4.4

Second Example of Translation by More Neutral/Less Expressive Word

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes	
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G		
10.3	Beauty and the Beast	Si cantik dan Buruk		V						V	"Beast" is usually used to refer to an animal.

The word 'beast' usually refers to an animal or something that has a bad connotation. In this context, 'beast' refers to a character that is half human. As opposed to translating it to its literal

meaning, the translator translated it to the more neutral word of “buruk” to maintain some part of the original meaning from the SL. Moreover, the translator chose “buruk” out of form consideration. The Indonesian word for ‘beast’ is ‘binatang buas’. However, it would be much longer if the translator used the literal meaning. The syllable of the Indonesian version is 6, whereas the English version has 5 syllables. If the translator used ‘binatang buas’, the Indonesian lyrics would have 9 syllables.

4.1.3 Translation by Paraphrase using Related Word

Translation by paraphrase using related word is used when the meaning in the SL and TL is the same but the form changes. There are some lyrics in the Indonesian chorus of the We Love Disney album that use translation by paraphrase using related word strategy. Below are some examples taken from the data:

Table 4.5

First Example of Translation by Paraphrase using Related Word

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G	
7.1	Do you want to build a snowman?	Yuk, buat boneka salju					V			The form of the sentence changed from question to statement or invitation.

In this part of the Do You Want to Build a Snowman lyrics, the SL and TL have similar meanings. The English version can be loosely translated to “Maukah kamu membuat boneka salju?”, which is similar to the Indonesian version. The SL and the TL convey an expression of inviting someone to play with snow and make a snowman. However, the English lyric uses question form whereas the Indonesian version uses statement form. The main consideration for this change of form was, again, based on the syllables. If the translator had used “Maukah kamu membuat boneka salju?”, the Indonesian lyrics would have had 13, as opposed to 8 syllables.

Table 4.6

Second Example of Translation by Paraphrase using Related Word

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G	
8.3	When you wish upon a star	Harapan pada bintang					V		V	“Berharap” was changed to “Harapan”

In this example, the words “when you wish upon a star” should have been translated as “saat kau berharap pada bintang”. The translator changed the word ‘berharap’ into ‘harapan’. The main reason for the change was because the translator considered the next line. The lyric in the next line is “terwujud”. If the translator had maintained the word “berharap”, the lyric would have said “berharap pada bintang, terwujud”. This does not make sense semantically. In other words, the main consideration in this example was neither meaning nor form. Rather, the decision was based mainly on context.

4.1.4 Translation by Paraphrase using Unrelated Word

This translation strategy is used when the word in the SL does not exist in the TL. The translator can use this strategy by giving a more detailed explanation of the word from the SL or translates it to a different word that has a similar meaning. There are some lyrics in the chorus of the Indonesian version of We Love Disney album that use translation by paraphrase using related word strategy. Below are some examples from the data:

Table 4.7

First Example of Translation by Paraphrase using Unrelated Word

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G	

7.2	Or ride our bike around the halls?	Atau kita berkejaran?							V		The TL conveys similar meanings using different words.
-----	------------------------------------	-----------------------	--	--	--	--	--	--	---	--	--

In this example, the SL and TL have similar meanings but different words were used to express those meanings. The meaning of the English version is “riding a bicycle around the halls”, whereas the Indonesian version uses “berkejaran” (race or chase) as a verb. Both refer to games played by two people or more, but do not represent the exact same activity.

Table 4.8

Second Example of Translation by Paraphrase using Unrelated Word

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes	
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G		
9.2	Darling, it's better down where it's wetter	Lebih baik di bawah laut							V	V	The words “down” and “where it's wetter” refer to the song title, which is “Under the Sea”

This lyric was taken from the ninth song, “Under the Sea”. The literal translation of this line is “sayang, lebih baik di bawah sana, di tempat yang lebih basah”. The translator used Paraphrase using Unrelated Word strategy when translating the words “where it's wetter” to “di bawah laut”. The literal meaning of “where it's wetter” is “di tempat yang lebih basah”. However, it could not be used after considering the context and the form. Since the title of the song is “Under the Sea”, the translator used “di bawah laut” to substitute “where it's wetter” instead of opting for word-for-word translation.

Moreover, the syllables of the Indonesian version would be longer than the original one if the word-for-word strategy was used. If the translator had used the words “di tempat yang lebih

basah”, the syllables would be 12. On the other hand, the syllables of the current Indonesian version is 9, whereas the English version has 10. More interestingly, however, is the consideration of the audience in this translation. When translated word-for-word, the Indonesian version will sound like, “sayang, lebih baik di bawah sana, di tempat yang lebih basah”. This translation carries a strong sexual innuendo that would be inappropriate for minors. This line is a good example of a situation in which a translator needs to consider meaning, form, and context altogether.

4.1.5 Translation by Omission

Translation by omission is used in the translation process by omitting words that do not play an important role in the original text. There are some lyrics in the chorus of the Indonesian version of We Love Disney album that use translation by omission. Below are some examples from the data:

Table 4.9

First Example of Translation by Omission

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G	
1.8	The cold never bothered me anyway	Rasa dingin tak pernah menggangguku							V	The word “anyway” was not translated.

In this line, the important message was conveyed through “the cold never bothered me”. If “anyway” had been translated into the TL, it would have been positioned as the first word in the lyric. The lyrics would sound, “Lagi pula, rasa dingin tak pernah menggangguku”. In this structure, “anyway” becomes a transition word that does not play an important role in the lyric. As such, the translator chose to omit the word. Moreover, the inclusion of “anyway” would make the lyric even longer. The syllable in the current Indonesian version is 11 while the English version has 10. If the word “anyway” had been kept, the syllables would have gone up to 15.

Table 4.10

Second Example of Translation by Omission

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies							Notes	
			A	B	C	D	E	F	G		
3.3	The dream that you wish will come true	Mimpimu akan nyata								V	“That you wish” was not translated

The third song in the Indonesian version of the We Love Disney album is “Mimpi adalah Harapan”. In this line, “that you wish” was not translated. The translator omitted that part because “dream” and “wish” have similar meanings. Additionally, the literal translation of this line would be “mimpi yang kuharapkan kan menjadi nyata”. Both the English and Indonesian lyrics have seven syllables. If the translator had kept the literal meaning, the lyrics would have had 11 syllables.

4.2 The Suitability of Strategies in Meaning and Form

This chapter analyzes the suitability of the strategies employed in the translation of the English version of We Love Disney album into the Indonesian version. The writer divides this chapter into two subsections. Chapter 4.2.1 is for the suitability of strategies in terms of meaning, and Chapter 4.2.2 is for the suitability of strategies in terms of form.

In the process of translating a song, translators have more than one consideration to make. They cannot simply pay attention to meaning; they also need to consider form (i.e rhyme and syllable), context, and suitability to the target audience. Therefore, this chapter aims at analyzing the suitability of the chosen strategies in terms of meaning and form as the two main components in song translation.

4.2.1 The Suitability of Strategies in Meaning

In this chapter, the writer analyzes the suitability of translation strategies in terms of meaning. This chapter is divided into two sub-chapters. The first sub-chapter presents some examples of the accurately used strategies, while the second sub-chapter discloses the inaccurately used strategies.

4.2.1.1 Accurately Used Strategies

This chapter presents examples of the accurately used strategies in the translation of the We Love Disney album from the lens of Mona Baker’s theory. The accuracy of these strategies was measured from the accuracy of the meaning transfer from the SL to the TL with the strategy as a tool.

Table 4.11

First Example of Accurately used Strategies

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies
2.4	Can you paint with all the colors of the wind?	Melukis dengan semua warna angin	Omission

In this line, the meaning in the SL was fully conveyed in the TL. The words “can you” were omitted in this line because it was already mentioned in the previous line of the Indonesian version. The previous line says “**Dapatkah** kau ikuti suara gunung”. Therefore, the lines become “Dapatkah kau ikuti suara gunung, (Dapatkah kau) melukis dengan semua warna angin”. It shows a continuation of a question form in this chorus.

Table 4.12

Second Example of Accurately used Strategies

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies
5.1	Someday when spring is here	Saat musim semi	Omission

The line from “Someday My Prince will Come” used the translation by omission strategy. In terms of meaning, the key message in this line is “when spring is here”. The use of “when” implies that it is a future event. Therefore, the word “someday” can be omitted because it offers the same function, which is a future time marker. Secondly, the translator also considered form. The English and Indonesian versions of this line contain 6 syllables. If the translator had kept the word “someday”, the syllable of the Indonesian version would be 11 due to the addition of “suatu hari”.

Table 4.13

Third Example of Accurately used Strategies

No .	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies
6.5	A whole new world, with new horizons to pursue	Dunia baru, dengan cakrawala baru	Omission

This line also used translation by omission strategy. The translator omitted the word “pursue” because a similar word was used in the next line. The word “chase”, which has a similar meaning to ‘pursue’, was placed in the next line. With this consideration, the translator employed omission to avoid repetition. This line is another example of the consideration of context in song translation.

4.2.1.2 Inaccurately Used Strategies

This chapter presents examples of the inaccurately used strategies in the translation of the We Love Disney album. These examples were chosen to show the inaccuracy of the strategy choice, as well as a better strategy alternative.

Table 4.14

First Example of Inaccurately Used Strategies

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies
1.4	That perfect girl is gone	Ku berpaling menjauh	No translation strategy

In this first example, the translator did not use any of Baker’s translation strategies. The writer argues that this was not the right decision. This line could be translated using the Paraphrase Using Unrelated Word strategy into “Ku tak sama lagi”. The word “gone” in this line means that the old version of the girl has been replaced by a new version. Meanwhile,

the subject “that perfect girl” can be simply translated into “ku” because the singer talks about herself. In other words, “Ku tak sama lagi” offers a closer translation to the TL than “Ku berpaling menjauh”, which indicates an active verb of walking away from something.

Table 4.15

Second Example of Inaccurately Used Strategies

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies
1.6	In the light of day	Ku berdiri	No translation strategy

Similar to the first case, the translator did not employ any of Baker’s strategy to translate this line. However, the writer argues that Paraphrase using Unrelated Word would be a good strategy for this line. The previous line says, “here I stand” which translates to “di sini ku berdiri”. The translator put “di sini” to substitute “here I stand”, moving the “ku berdiri” to the next line to replace “in the light of day”. The writer thinks this was not the best strategy, because both lines could be accommodated. There are several words in Indonesian that could have been used to convey the meaning in the SL. The translator could have used “di siang hari”, “di bawah terik”, or “di bawah mentari”. The first two options have the exact same syllables as the TL, which contains 5 syllables. With this strategy, the Indonesian lyric would say, “berdiri di bawah terik”. This translation would be sufficient to cover both meaning and form.

Table 4.16

Third Example of Inaccurately Used Strategies

No.	English Version	Indonesian Version	Translation Strategies
12.1	And at last I see the light	Ku melihat cahaya	Omission

The literal translation for "And at last I see the light" is "Dan akhirnya ku melihat cahaya". However, the translator omitted the words "and at last" and kept the rest. "At last" in this lyric expresses a feeling when something finally happens. This expression was not conveyed by the translator. Unlike the conjunction "and", the words "at last" matter because they imply that the subject was in darkness, and that she finally saw the light. The struggle was not conveyed due to the omission. The writer argues that "Sekarang semua terang" or "Akhirnya ada cahaya" would capture the meaning in a more complete manner.

4.2.2 The Suitability of Strategies in Form

In this chapter, the writer discusses the accuracy of the chosen translation strategies in terms of form. Below is a table of summary of strategy accuracy in terms of rhyme and syllable. The "V" symbol means that the English and Indonesian lyrics match in that aspect, whereas "X" suggests inconsistency.

Table 4.17

Summary Table of Strategy Accuracy in Form

No	Song Title	Rhyme	Syllable
1	Let It Go	X	X
2	Colors of the Wind	V	V
3	A Dream is a Wish Your Heart Makes	V	X
4	Can You Feel the Love Tonight	X	V
5	Someday My Prince will Come	X	X
6	A Whole New World	X	X
7	Do You Wanna Build a Snowman	X	X
8	When You Wish Upon a Star	X	X
9	Under the Sea	X	X
10	Beauty and the Beast	X	X
11	You'll be in My Heart	X	X
12	I See the Light	X	X

After comparing the rhymes and syllables of both the English and Indonesian lyrics, the writer is able to present a summary table that details the compatibility of both lyrics in terms of rhymes and syllables. The above table offers conclusive findings that the 12 songs can be categorized under three categories: (1) matching in both rhymes and syllables; (2) matching in either rhymes or syllables; and (3) not matching in rhymes or syllables.

First of all, out of the 12 songs analyzed in this study, only one song, “Colors of the Wind”, matched in both rhymes and syllables. The rhymes of the English and Indonesian version are ABCDD. The English and Indonesian versions also have the exact same syllables in each of the chorus lines. The first line has 13 syllables, the second line has 10 syllables, and the last three lines have 11 syllables each.

Next, two songs fall under the second bracket, which is matching in either rhymes or syllables. The two songs are ‘A Dream is a Wish Your Heart Makes’ and ‘Can You Feel the Love Tonight’. In the song ‘Can You Feel the Love Tonight’, the rhymes in the English and Indonesian choruses are different. The rhyme of the English version is AABB, whereas the rhyme of the Indonesian version is ABCC. However, the syllables of both versions remain the same. The first and third lines of both versions have thirteen syllables. The second line of both versions has fifteen syllables. Finally, the fourth line of both versions has sixteen syllables. This suggests that the translator prioritized fitting the syllables more than the rhymes of the song. On the other hand, the syllables of ‘A Dream is a Wish Your Heart Makes’ in both versions are different. In the English version, the third line of the chorus has eight syllables, whereas the Indonesian version has seven syllables. However, this song uses the same rhyme in both versions, which is AAB.

Finally, a glaring nine out of twelve songs in the We Love Disney album did not match in rhymes and syllables. In the fifth song, “Someday My Prince will Come”, for example, the rhyme of the English version is ABCB, and the rhyme of the Indonesian version is AABC. The syllables of the English and Indonesian version are also different. The third line of the chorus in the English version has ten syllables. On the other hand, the Indonesian version has twelve syllables.

Another example can be seen from the song “Do You Wanna Build a Snowman”. The rhyme of the English version is ABCB, whereas the rhyme of the Indonesian version is ABCD. Next, the syllables in some lines of the English and Indonesian version are also different. The third line of the English version has 10 syllables, whereas the Indonesian version has 8 syllables. The last line of the choruses is also different. The English version has 12 syllables, whereas the Indonesian version has 14 syllables. These statistics suggest that between form

and meaning, translators often struggle to fulfill the form requirement more than meaning as it involves two sub-components which are rhymes and syllables.