IV. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

In analyzing the data, I examine the errors that have been grouped into linguistic error categories. Each type of linguistic error category is divided again into linguistic subcategories, and classified into a more detail problem areas. Here, the analysis is based on the fact of the errors produced by the students. It is important to note that each composition is presented as it is without any changes at all. In other words, every composition used in the analysis is in its original form. For the convenience of the analysis, I examine each sample that has been numbered.

Furthermore, the findings are presented in tables showing classification and frequency of errors, and the detail interpretation will be developed through these tables. The overall findings have been summed up in this following table:

Table 2: English Error in Composition

No.	Error Category	Frequency	Percentage
1.	**Lexical Category**		
	- Nouns subcategory	13	4.51
	- Verbs subcategory	14	4.86
	- Adjectives subcategory	1	0.35
	- Adverbs subcategory	6	2.08
	Subtotal	34	<u>11.8</u>
2.	**Morphological Category**		
	- Tense markers subcategory	61	21.18
	- Negative markers subcategory	-	-
	- Plural markers subcategory	59	20.49
	Subtotal	120	<u>41.67</u>

3.	**Syntactic Category**		
	- Articles subcategory	**27**	**9.38**
	- Demonstrative Adjectives subcategory	**7**	**2.43**
	- Possessive Adjectives subcategory	**3**	**1.04**
	- Modals subcategory	**7**	**2.43**
	- Qualifiers subcategory	**-**	**-**
	- Prepositions subcategory	**14**	**4.86**
	- Conjunctions subcategory	**2**	**0.69**
	- Sentence connectors subcategory	**2**	**0.69**
	- Subordinators subcategory	**6**	**2.08**
	- Question words subcategory	**1**	**0.35**
	- Word order subcategory	**3**	**1.04**
	- Other syntactic classes	**34**	**11.81**
	Subtotal	**106**	**36.8**
4.	**Orthographic Category**		
	- Letters subcategory	**11**	**3.82**
	- Punctuation subcategory	**12**	**4.17**
	- Capitalization subcategory	**5**	**1.74**
	Subtotal	**28**	**9.73**
	TOTAL	**288**	**100**

Based on the table above, the highest percentage of error type is the morphological errors with 41.67%, and the least percentage of errors is the orthographic errors with 9.73%. It is also seen that the syntactic errors reaches a big percentage among the error types, 36.8%, while the lexical errors is only accounting for 11.8%. The analysis of the findings follows an emphatic order (order of importance), in which I discuss the data from the least committed type of

errors up to the most committed type of errors. Consequently, following this order, I will analyze, first, the orthographic category, second, the lexical category, third, the syntactic category, and fourth, the morphological category.

4.1 ORTHOGRAPHIC CATEGORY

The orthographic category, which consists of the errors in letter, punctuation and capitalization, gains the smallest percentage for linguistics errors in composition (9.68%). There are totally twenty-seven errors of orthography found in this study. In this category, the students made almost half of the number of their errors in the use of punctuation (42.86%). In other words, among the subcategories, errors in punctuation take the biggest percentage, followed by errors in the use of letter (39.29%) and, finally, errors in capitalization (17.85%).

Table 3: Orthographic Category

No.	Orthographic Category	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Errors in Letter	11	39.29
2.	Errors in Punctuation	12	42.86
3.	Errors in Capitalization	5	17.85
	TOTAL	28	100

4.1.1 Letters Subcategory

Letters subcategory contributes for 39.29% in the orthographic category. The dominant percentage of errors in this subcategory is possibly be caused by the fact that in English the spelling of a word (the spoken form) is different from the written form. For this subcategory of error, there are five problems areas based on the Hendrickson error classification of orthography, which are the addition, omission, substitution, rearrangement and malformation of letters.

Table 4: Letters Subcategory

No.	Letters Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Addition of letter	3	27.27
2.	Omission of letter	1	9.1
3.	Substitution of letter	1	9.1
4.	Rearrangement of letter	5	45.45
5.	Malformation of letter	1	9.1
	TOTAL	**11**	**100**

For one thing, the students produced error simply by adding a letter to a particular word, especially to adjectives. The addition of letter is clearly seen in data number **7.0**: "Helpfull Fairies" (correct form: 'helpful'), data number **12.8**: "The old man was thankfull and then sewn them a clothes" (correct form: 'thankful'), and data number **13.8**: "They were happy and thankfull to the fairy" (correct form: 'thankful'). This kind of problem might be caused by the tendency of the students to add '-*full*' ending at the end of a verb in order to turn it into an adjective. In this case, the students over generalized the rules since there are some words in English which do not use the ending '-*full*' but '-*ful*.'

Another problem in this category is caused by the omission of a letter in a word, which is seen in data number **15.5**: "Fist of all, he always help children…" In this data, the student omitted the letter 'r' for the word 'first.' Furthermore, half of the errors (50%) in this subcategory deal with the rearrangement of letter. Data number **7.6**: "Infact, not every people could buy shoes," is categorized as a problem of rearrangement letters, in which the word 'in fact' is rearranged into 'infact.' One error is found in the area of substitution of letter in data number **11.11**, "The fairies were very happy, than they went home (correct form = then)." The last problem area in the letters subcategory is the malformation of letter presented in data number **4.11**: "Thanx to the fairies." Here, the appropriate word for 'thanx' is 'thanks.' Here, the student used the slang words for 'thanks' by changing the letter 'ks' with 'x' in a formal context.

4.1.2 Punctuation Subcategory

The punctuation subcategory covers the deviant forms in the use of period, comma, question mark, exclamation mark, and hyphens. Nevertheless, there are only two types of errors found in the data, which are errors in the use of comma and hyphen. The errors in the use of hyphen gains the highest percentage in this subcategory that is more than half of the total number of errors (66.67%), and the rests belong to the group of errors in comma (33.33%).

Table 5: Punctuation Subcategory

No.	Punctuation Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Errors in period	-	-
2.	Errors in comma	4	33.33
3.	Errors in question mark	-	-
4.	Errors in exclamation mark	-	-
5.	Errors in hyphen	8	66.67
	TOTAL	**12**	**100**

All of the errors in comma happen in the sentences that contain more than one main idea. In this case, the students tend to use a comma instead of a semicolon to combine the two complete different ideas. Data number **6.7** is one example of this case: "Finally, all the fairy who gave those shoes come out**,** the fairy said that those shoes were present for them because they were kind to all people in the village." This sentence will be correct if the comma is substituted with a semicolon, "Finally, all the fairies who gave those shoes came out**;** the fairies said that those shoes were presents for them because they were kind to all people in the village."

Moreover, the entire problems in hyphen presented in the data deal with the word 'shoemaker.' As a matter of fact, the students combined the word 'shoe' and 'maker' into 'shoe-maker.' A clear picture of this explanation is seen in data number **10.1**: "Long time ago, there was an old <u>shoe-maker</u> that lived in the little village." The correct form of this sentence is: "Long time ago, there was an old shoemaker that lived in a little village."

4.1.3 Capitalization Subcategory

There are only five errors out of twenty-seven orthographic errors committed in this capitalization subcategory. Here, the students mostly produced errors in writing a proper title. It is shown in the data number **2.0**: "The f̲airy and Mr. Shoemaker." The correct form of this data is "The Fairy and Mr. Shoemaker." Actually, the beginning letter of a word, except for prepositions, conjunctions and determiners, must be capitalized in a title. Even though the rules of capitalization in English language are the same as in the Indonesian language (the native language), it is quite often for the students to make an error in its application.

Another case of misuse in capitalization is related with the misconception of capitalization, in the sense that the student capitalized not the beginning letter of a word, but all letters in a word. It can be observed in data number **14.10**: "The old man and his wife thanked to G̲O̲D̲ for H̲I̲S̲ kindness to them." The sentence will improve if it is changed into, "The old man and his wife thanked to G̲o̲d̲ for H̲i̲s̲ kindness to them." Furthermore, it is important to notice that the errors in capitalization in this study happen in nouns only, like the words fairy, man, shoemaker, God, and His.

4.2 LEXICAL CATEGORY

This category, while not accounting for a very large percentage of all errors, is interesting in that it reveals student's knowledge of nouns, verbs, adjectives and adverbs in describing the visual content of the picture stories. There are four subcategories of errors identified in this category, which are, *incorrect use of nouns, verbs, adjectives and adverbs.* In this study, the lexical error committed most frequently by the students belongs to the verb subcategory (41.18%). However, the noun subcategory is also counted for the great majority of all errors in this category, which is for 38.26%. High percentage in the verbs and nouns subcategories indicates the fact that verbs and nouns are used highly in writing a composition. Finally, the adverb subcategory takes 17.64%, and the least frequent errors subcategory, the adjective, gets 2.94%.

Table 6: Lexical Category

No.	Lexical Category	Number of	Percentage

		Errors	
1.	**Noun subcategory**	**13**	**38.26**
2.	**Verb subcategory**	**14**	**41.18**
3.	**Adjective subcategory**	**1**	**2.94**
4.	**Adverb subcategory**	**6**	**17.64**
	TOTAL	**34**	**100**

4.2.1 Noun Subcategory

According to the data, the nouns subcategory includes the misuse and omission of certain nouns. Based on the data, the students are more frequently using a wrong choice of noun (84.62%) rather than omitting them (15.38%).

Table 7: Noun Subcategory

No.	Noun Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Misuse of Noun	**11**	**84.62**
2.	Omission of Noun	**2**	**15.38**
	TOTAL	**13**	**100**

The example of a misuse in noun can be seen in data number **3.4**: "They made shoes not only for materials." Here, the word 'materials' as noun is misused in the sentence. Actually, the word 'materials' as a noun means some elements used to make something. If the writer wants to use the word 'material', then it should be in the form of an adjective which means 'related to physical or worldly', and followed by a noun 'things', thus the sentence would be: "They made shoes not only for material things." But, since it is a noun ('materials), I correct this sentence by changing the word 'materials' with another noun that has the same meaning, which is 'money.' As a result, the suggested correction is: "They made shoes not only for money."

Another important misuse of nouns that occurred in the data is the misuse of pronoun; in which there are five from eleven misuses of nouns belongs to pronoun. For one thing, in data number **3.11**: "They were so happy and want to

thank **you**," and data number **14.11**: "They made a lot of clothes to the fairies to thank **you**", the students misused the pronoun 'you' for 'them.' This error might be caused by the fact that the students think that the complete verb of 'to thank' is 'to thank you,' thus, they used this verb without changing the pronoun.

The omission of certain nouns deals with the omitted word *'pair of'* in the phrase *'a new shoes.'* It can be seen in data number **2.8**: "When there was a young child, he freely gave them a (**pair of**) new shoes," and data number **6.6**: "There was a beautiful (**pair of**) shoes on the table, they were confused who had given that shoes."

4.2.2 Verb Subcategory

The verb subcategory gains the biggest percentage in the lexical error category. Errors in the use of verbs are only found in the misuse of verbs (100%), while the omission of verbs is not found.

Table 8: Verb Subcategory

No.	Verb Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Misuse of Verb	14	100
2.	Omission of Verb	0	0
	TOTAL	14	100

The problems in using the wrong verb can be seen in the word 'to thank.' Based on the data, there are many students misuse the verb 'to thank' by using the verb 'to thankful,' or employing redundant phrase like 'to say thank you to.' For example, data number **2.16**: "Because that, they decided to thankful to them." The to-infinitive verb is misused here. The sentence improves if 'thankful' (adjective form) is changed into 'thank' (simple present verb), so the construction will be, "Because of that, they decided to thank them."

4.2.3 Adjective Subcategory

The lexical category also includes some problems in adjectives, particularly the misuse of adjectives. This subcategory takes the least proportion of lexical category (2.94%). Moreover, there is no error in adjective subcategory caused by the omission of an adjective in the data.

The only problem in the adjective subcategory exists in data number **5.11**: "The fairy felt happy and because their obligation was finished, the fairy left the shoemaker and <u>the another</u> people." The appropriate form of adjective in this sentence is 'other' and not 'another' because the following word of <u>another</u> is 'people' (plural). There will be a disagreement in number if it uses 'another' since 'another' is used in relation with singular noun (e.g. person), and not with plural noun. Therefore this sentence is corrected into, "The fairy felt happy and because their obligation was finished, the fairy left the shoemaker and helped <u>other</u> people."

4.2.4 Adverb Subcategory

The last subcategory in lexical category is the adverb subcategory (17.64%). It is the same as the adjective subcategory, in the sense that this subcategory only deals with the misuse of adverb, without any omission of adverb.

Table 9: Adverb Subcategory

No.	Adverb Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Misuse of Adverb	6	100
2.	Omission of Adverb	0	0
	TOTAL	6	100

The problems of misuse of adverbs found in the compositions are mostly related with the adverb of time such as 'someday' or 'sometimes.' For example, in the data number **2.10**: "<u>Someday</u>, a miracle has happened," the student should have used 'one day' instead of 'someday.' Another example of misuse of adverb is shown in data number **13.2**: "He was a nice old man, he always gave a pair of

shoes to a poor child, <u>no pay at all.</u>" Here, the phrase 'no pay at all' is considered as redundancy since in English the simple adverb for it is 'for free.' As a result, the correction will be, "He was a nice old man; he always gave a pair of shoes to poor children for free."

4.3 SYNTACTIC CATEGORY

In general, problems of syntax reflect the knowledge of English Standard grammar and usually gain the highest percentage among other categories of error. Although in this study, the highest percentage belongs to the morphological category, the syntactic category is still accounting for a dominant percentage (36.8%). These findings suggest that most of the students of Writing I still have difficulties and problems in the use of Standard English grammar, particularly for a more elaborate use of English.

Based on the table below, the syntactic category is classified into twelve subcategories, which includes the problems of article, demonstrative and possessive adjective, modal, qualifier, preposition, conjunction, sentence connector, subordinator, question word, word order and other uncategorized syntactic classes. The highest percentage of errors found in this category deals with the other syntactic classes subcategory (32.08 %), and followed by article subcategory (26.41%). The preposition subcategory is also produced quite frequently by the students (13.2%). The other subcategories, such as demonstrative and possessive adjective, modal, conjunction, sentence connectors and so forth, get almost the same low percentage.

Table 10: Syntactic Category

No.	Syntactic Category	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Article subcategory	27	26.41
2.	Demonstrative adjective subcategory	7	6.6
3.	Possessive adjective subcategory	3	2.83

4.	Modal subcategory	7	6.6
5.	Qualifier subcategory	-	-
6.	Preposition subcategory	14	13.2
7.	Conjunction subcategory	2	1.88
8.	Sentence connector subcategory	2	1.88
9.	Subordinator subcategory	6	5.66
10.	Question word subcategory	1	0.94
11.	Word order subcategory	3	2.83
12.	Other syntactic classes	34	32.08
	TOTAL	106	100

4.3.1 Article Subcategory

There are twenty-seven of errors concerning with the use of articles (26.41%), that include the misuse and omission of articles. Here, over half of the errors in the article subcategory deal with the misuse of article (74.07%). In addition, nine out of twenty-nine errors (25.93%) are related to the omission of article.

Table 11: Article Subcategory

No.	Article Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Misuse of article	20	74.07
2.	Omission of article	7	25.93
	TOTAL	27	100

The errors that deal with the misuse of article are produced by substituting the article 'a' with the article 'the' (wrong selection of article) and overusing the article. First of all, the misuses of articles are caused by a wrong selection of articles can be seen in data number **2.10**: "Someday, the miracle has happened," data number **4.10**: "Later the lives of the shoemaker not in the poor condition anymore," data number **7.1**: "A couple of old man and old woman were lived in the village," and so forth. Actually, the article 'the' is used only for definite things, while the article 'a' is used for indefinite things, but in the data, the

students sometimes used a definite article instead of an indefinite article. This kind of problem may be caused by the fact that the students do not know about the difference between 'a' and 'the' in real context. Consequently, it produces a defiant form of article.

In addition, some of the wrong selections of articles are caused by the inclusions of unnecessary articles such as found in data number **5.1**: "There was one old man who make a shoe for a children who haven't shoes." Here, the indefinite article 'a' is unnecessary, so the use of article in this sentence must be deleted into: "There was one old man who made shoes for children who did not have shoes."

The last problem area in the article subcategory is omission of articles, which is shown in the data number **1.6**: "He didn't know who has already given it, until next day his wife saw there was many fairies on his desk (correct form: the next day)" or in the data number **1.7**: "They were so happy and then they wanted to give something to fairies, so they sewed some clothes for them (correct form: the fairies)."

4.3.2 Demonstrative Adjective Subcategory

There are only seven cases (6.6%) out of one hundred and six cases in syntactic category that is related with demonstrative adjective subcategory. All of the errors in this subcategory happened because of the improper use of 'that' (singular demonstrative adjective) instead of 'those' (plural demonstrative adjective). The students probably are not aware or do not pay attention to the plural noun following the demonstrative adjective. As a result, they gave a singular demonstrative adjective (that) to a plural noun. The example of this kind of errors is presented in data number **7.13**: "He told that he did not make that shoes (correct form: those)," data number **8.7**: "Then he know that the fairies gave that shoes for him (correct form: those), and so on.

4.3.3 Possessive Adjective Subcategory

Another subcategory in syntactic categories is the possessive adjective subcategory that occurred only three times in the data (2.83%). This subcategory

mainly refers to the misuse and rearrangement of the possessive adjective. The misuse of possessive adjective can be seen in data number **5.12** and data number **9.7**, while the malformation of possessive adjective is shown in data number **6.12**. As an illustration, data number **5.12**: "Since that day, the shoemaker become a rich old man because everyone always buy a pair of shoes at <u>their</u> office," selected a wrong possessive pronoun, in the sense that the student employed 'their' instead of 'his' to refer to the possessive adjective of 'the shoemaker' (singular). This data is corrected into: "Since that day, the shoemaker became a rich old man because everyone always bought a pair of shoes at <u>his</u> office." Furthermore, the rearrangement of possessive adjective is stated in data number **6.12**: "They were touched and thankful for all <u>the kindness from them</u>." Here, the phrase 'the kindness from them' is supposed to be 'their kindness.'

4.3.4 Modal Subcategory

Seven errors are found in the case of modals (6.6%). Within the modal subcategory, there are four problem areas occurred such as the use of 'must' instead of 'had to' (28.58%), the malformation of the next verbal word (28.58%), the disagreement of tense with modal (28.58%), and the use of unnecessary modal (14.26).

Table 12: Modal Subcategory

No.	Modal Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Use of *must* instead of *had to*	2	28.58
2.	Malformation of the next verbal word	2	28.58
3.	Disagreement of tense with modal	2	28.58
4.	Unnecessary use of modal	1	14.26
	TOTAL	**7**	**100**

For one thing, the students produced defiant forms in the modal subcategory simply by using *must* instead of *had to* in referring to a past situation. For instance, in data number **1.8**: "The fairies were so thankful but they were very sad because they <u>must to</u> left them." In this example, the context given is in the past situation; therefore, the modal should be 'had to' and not 'must.' The correct form

must be: "The fairies were so thankful but they were very sad because they <u>had to</u> leave them." This problem is probably caused by the fact that the students are more familiar with the modal 'must' as a modal which expresses a need or obligation rather than with 'have to.'

Another two cases of malformation of the next verbal word become one of the problems in the modal subcategory, like in data number **10.17**: "Because of the fairies, the old shoe-maker <u>could sold</u> the shoes and got a lot of advantages from it." It is obviously an error since the student used a past verb 'sold' instead of an infinitive 'sell' to follow the modal 'could.' This kind of errors might happen due to the fact that the students misunderstand the rules of modals in English, in the sense that they also change the next verbal word in the modal into a past verb when the modal is in the past form.

Thirdly, the disagreement of tense with modal can be seen in data number **4.9**: "He was so happy and still there were many shoes that he <u>can</u> sell and still some <u>can</u> be given for other children,' in which the student employed the modals 'can' instead of 'could' in a past situation. Here, the students might not know the pattern of modal in past form, or they might think that the modal 'can' is used both in present and past situation. As a consequence, the students employed the modal 'can' in present and past situation.

The last problem area found in the modal subcategory is the use of unnecessary modal. This kind of problem occurs in data number **7.20**: "Since that night, the old man and his wife <u>could know</u> the answer and they wanted to say thank you to the fairies." In this case, the use of a modal is inappropriate, and the correct sentence should be: "Since that night, the old man and his wife <u>knew</u> the answer and they wanted to thank the fairies."

4.3.5 Preposition Subcategory

There are totally fourteen errors in the case of preposition (13.2%). Nine of them deal with the misuse of preposition (64.29%), and the other four related to the omission of preposition (35.71%).

Table 13: Preposition Subcategory

No.	Preposition Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Misuse of preposition	**9**	**64.29**
2.	Omission of preposition	**5**	**35.71**
	TOTAL	**14**	**100**

For the misuse of preposition, one of the examples can be found in data number **1.6**: "He didn't know who has already given it, until next day his wife saw there was many fairies <u>at</u> their house," in which it is considered as the misuse of preposition of place. The student here used the preposition 'at,' and it should be changed into 'in' in order to be appropriate. As a matter of fact, there are so many prepositions are employed in English grammar, and the application each preposition is different from one another. For instance, the place prepositions consist of a number of prepositions such as in, on and at. Although these prepositions have similar meaning, they are used with different kinds of places. In general, *in* is used before large places and very small places (in country, in city, in a house); *on* is used before middle-sized places (on street, on a plane); and *at* is used before numbers in addresses (at 1300 Abbey Road).

Meanwhile, one of the cases of omission of preposition exists in data number **7.19**: "The old man could not say anything, he looked at them <u>so long</u> and said, "Oh!"" In this example, a preposition must be attached before the words 'so long,' thus the correct sentence will be: "The old man could not say anything, he looked at them <u>for so long</u> and said, "Oh!""

4.3.6 Conjunction Subcategory

Conjunction subcategory is only contributing for 1.88% of the total of syntactic category. From the two cases of conjunctions, both of them are related to the misuse and omission of conjunctions 'and'.

Table 14: Conjunction Subcategory

No.	Conjunction Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Misuse of conjunction	**1**	**50**
2.	Omission of conjunction	**1**	**50**
	TOTAL	**2**	**100**

The misuse of conjunctions is caused by the overuse of the conjunction, which is stated in data number **4.6**: "The shoemaker's wife was so surprised, <u>and yet</u> pleasantly of what the fairies have done for her husband." In this matter, actually the student should omit the conjunction 'and,' so that there is only one conjunction applied in the sentence. The correction is: "The shoemaker's wife was so surprised, <u>yet</u> pleased for what the fairies have done for her husband." Another problem of conjunctions is due to the omission of a conjunction, for instance, data number **11.11**: "The fairies were very happy, <u>than</u> they went home." This sentence will improve much if it is added with a conjunction 'and,' which becomes: "The fairies were very happy, <u>and then</u> they went home."

4.3.7 Sentence Connector Subcategory

There are two errors belong to the sentence connector subcategory, which is counting for 1.88% from the total of syntactic category. All of these errors are considered as wrong selection of sentence connectors. One example of these misuses of sentence connectors is presented in data number **8.7**: "<u>Then</u> he know that the fairies gave that shoes for him." In this sentence, the appropriate sentence connector is 'finally,' and not 'then,' therefore, the correct sentence should be: "<u>Finally</u>, he knew that the fairies gave those shoes for him." Wrong selection of the sentence connectors might be caused by the fact that the students only know a very limited type of sentence connectors in English. Consequently, the students do not able to use the appropriate sentence connector in a particular context.

4.3.8 Subordinator Subcategory

There are six cases of subordinator subcategory (5.66%) out which are related to the wrong selection of subordinator. One of the examples of misuse in subordinator subcategory can be seen in data number **3.12**: "Because they don't have anything to give as presents <u>reminded</u> they were poor, so the grandmother sewed some clothes for the fairies." The word 'reminded' is supposed to be changed with a subordinator 'since,' thus, the sentence will be: "They did not have anything to give as presents <u>since</u> they were poor, so the grandmother sewed some clothes for the fairies."

Another case of wrong selection of subordinators occurs in the data number **12.9**: "<u>Until</u> that the old man became famous to be a shoesmaker." In this sentence, the subordinator 'until' is incorrect since it is not connected with the context of the sentence. Consequently, it must be changed with a subordinator 'since,' so the correct sentence is: "<u>Since</u> then the old man became a famous shoemaker." One of the causes of this problem is probably due to the lack of knowledge in English subordinator, so that the students misused the subordinators.

4.3.9 Question Word Subcategory

The question word problem subcategory only occurs once in the compositions written by the students of Writing I. This problem caused by wrong selection of question word can be noticed in data number **2.12**: "They didn't know <u>why</u> and felt they never made it." Here, the question word 'why' is considered to be inappropriate with the context of the composition as a whole, and it should be 'how.' Therefore, the correction that is applied becomes: "They didn't know <u>how</u> it happened and felt they never made it."

4.3.10 Word Order Subcategory

This word order subcategory consists of totally three errors (2.83%) out of one hundred and six syntactic errors. These errors concern with the wrong word order of possessive pronoun, indirect question word, and adjective.

Table 15: Word Order Subcategory

No.	Word Order Subcategory	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Misplace of possessive pronoun	1	33.33
2.	Misplace of indirect question word	1	33.33
3.	Misplace of adjective	1	33.33
	TOTAL	**3**	**100**

As presented in table 15 above, each problem area has the same percentage of occurrence that is 33.33%. One of the problem areas is related to the wrong word order of possessive pronoun. It happens in data number **6.12**: "They were touched and thankful for all <u>the kindness from them</u>." This sentence is considered as a deviant form in the sense that it employs wrong word order of possessive pronoun. In English, in making a possessive phrase, the possessive pronoun must precede the noun. Thus, the sentence is changed into: "They were touched and thankful for all their kindness."

There is also an error that concerning indirect question word orders. Data number **12.6**: "So he run out to his house to saw <u>who is that</u>," is clearly an error, in the sense that the question word is directly followed by 'to be,' and not by a noun. Actually, the correct form of this pattern must be: "So he run out to his house to see <u>who it was</u>," in which the question word is followed by a noun (it) and 'to be.'

Finally, there is an error that deals with misplace of adjective found in data number **12.9**: "Until that the old man became <u>famous to be a shoesmaker</u>." In this case, the error occurs since the order of words in an adjective phrase in English is: determiner + adjective + noun. However, the student violates the rules and changes it into: adjective + to be + determiner + noun. As a consequence, the structure is not valid, and it must be: "Since then the old man became <u>a famous shoemaker</u>."

4.3.11 Other Syntactic Classes

The overall number of errors in this subcategory is quite big (32.08%), as compared with the other subcategories in the syntactic category. As stated in the table below, there are seven cases (20.59%) dealing with the misuse of 'to be' in 'there/that is' form, six cases of misuse of passive form for active form (17.65%), six cases of misuse of active form instead of passive form (17.65%), five cases of incorrect past perfect tense (14.7%), one problem of formation of negation (2.94%), two cases of incorrect progressive form (5.88%), four cases of omission of to be (11.76%) and three cases of omission of subject (8.8%). To sum up, incorrect form of 'there/that is' gains the highest percentage, while the formation of negation gets the lowest percentage of errors.

Table 16: Other Syntactic Classes

No.	Other Syntactic Classes	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Misuse of to be in 'there/that is' form	7	20.59
2.	Misuse of passive form for active form	6	17.65
3.	Misuse of active form for passive form	6	17.65
4.	Misuse of past perfect tense	5	14.7
5.	Formation of negation without auxiliary do	1	2.94
6.	Misuse of to be in progressive form	2	5.88
7.	Omission of verb (to be)	4	11.76
8.	Omission of subject	3	8.8
	TOTAL	**34**	**100**

The most common error, seven cases out of thirty-four errors, occurred in the 'there/that is' problem area. As an illustration, it can be observed in data number **1.1**: "Once upon a time, in a small village, <u>there is</u> an old poor shoes maker." The 'to be (is)' applied in the data is incorrect. It must be 'was' since the context given in the data is in the past situation. The appropriate sentence is: "Once upon a time, in a small village, <u>there was</u> an old poor shoemaker."

The misuse of passive form instead of active form is also accounting for a big percentage in this subcategory (17.65%). In data number **2.5**: "The man <u>was worked</u> as a Mr. Shoesmaker," the verb must be put in an active form, and not in

passive form. Thus, the sentence improves if it is changed into: "The man <u>worked</u> as a Mr. Shoemaker." On the other hand, there are also six cases related to the use of passive form in an active form context. For example, data number **4.4**: "That is why the shoemaker lives in a poor condition, cause he never charge any of his shoes which <u>have given</u> to the children" contains of an inappropriate use of active form. The active form must be changed into a passive form, which is presented as follow: "That was why the shoemaker lived in a poor condition, because he never charged any of his shoes which <u>have been given</u> to the children."

In addition to that, this subcategory includes the five misuse of past perfect tense form (14.7%). One of the examples can be seen in data number **2.13**: "At one night after that, Mr. Shoesmaker's wife <u>had woke</u> up suddenly." In English, past perfect tense is used to refer to an action that happened before another action in the past. Nevertheless, the sentence stated above does not employ this sequence; as a result, it must not use a past perfect tense. This sentence is corrected into: "One night after that, Mr. Shoemaker's wife <u>woke</u> up suddenly."

Another problem in this subcategory correlates with the problem of negative formation. It is described in data number **5.1**: "There was one old man who make a shoe for a children who <u>haven't</u> shoes", in which the student omits the auxiliary 'do' in forming a negative formation. This sentence will be correct if it is added with the auxiliary 'did,' and turns into: "There was one old man who made shoes for children who <u>did not have</u> shoes."

The problem of misuse of 'to be' in progressive form exists in data number **3.10**: "And apparently, there were some little fairy <u>was</u> helping them by making beautiful shoes for them." Since the subject of this sentence is plural (some little fairies), thus the 'to be' in the progressive form must also be in plural form (were). The correction of this data will be: "And apparently, there were some little fairies <u>were</u> helping them by making beautiful shoes for them."

Furthermore, there are also some omissions of *to be* in the compositions. In example data number **2.7**: "He <u>(was)</u> kind too," data number **4.10**: "Later, the life of the shoemaker <u>(was)</u> not in a poor condition anymore," data number **8.8**: "And he <u>(was)</u> very happy, so that he and his wife made some small clothes for those fairies, because the fairies were not wearing clothes," and so forth. Last of

all, the omission of subject is also classified as other syntactic classes problem. For instance, in data number **6.5**: "They were surprised when saw it." In this sentence, there is an omission of pronoun 'they.' The sentence is supposed to be "They were surprised when <u>they</u> saw it."

4.4 MORPHOLOGICAL CATEGORY

The highest percentage of errors in this study belongs to the morphological category (41.67%), in which it includes sixty-one errors in tense marker (50.83%) and fifty-seven errors in plural markers (49.17 %).

Table 17: Morphological Category

No.	Morphological Category	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Errors in tense marker	61	50.83
2.	Errors in negative marker	-	-
3.	Errors in plural marker	59	49.17
	TOTAL	120	100

One of the possible reasons of the high rating in this category is due to the students' lack of attention and awareness to the pattern of English tenses and plural forms. As a result, the students dropped the past tense marker and the plural marker, and misuse of both past and plural marker. Moreover, although there are three subcategories in the morphological category, there are only two subcategories that exist in the data. In other word, one of the subcategory (errors in negative marker) does not occur in this study.

4.4.1 Errors in Tense Marker

There are seven problem areas for this subcategory of error based on the data in this study. They are related to the omission of past tense marker, misuse of irregular past tense marker, misuse of – ing form by replacing it with either simple verb or past verb, replacement of –ing with simple verb or past verb in progressive

form, and disagreement of verb in 'to infinitive' form. The highest occurrence of these problem areas belongs to the misuse of irregular past tense marker (44.26%), followed by problems in omission of past tense marker (34.43%). The rest of the problem areas in this subcategory are counting only for low percentage.

Table 18: Tense Marker Subcategory

No.	Errors in Tense Marker	Number of Errors	Percentage
1.	Omission of past tense marker –*ed*	21	34.43
2.	Misuse of irregular past tense marker	27	44.26
3.	Simple verb used instead of –*ing*	3	4.92
4.	Past verb used instead of –*ing*	3	4.92
5.	Replacement of –*ing* in progressive form with simple verb form	1	1.64
6.	Replacement of –*ing* in progressive form with past verb form	1	1.64
7.	Disagreement of verb in *'to- infinitive'*	5	8.2
	TOTAL	61	100

4.4.1.1 *Omission of Past Tense Marker -ed*

There are 21 errors (34.43%) found in the data dealing with the omission of past tense marker –ed. Data number **3.2** can be classified as one example of this kind of error: "They lived in a small house, the grandfather earn their living needed by making shoes." This example consists of an error as the student omitted the past tense marker –ed. The verb 'earn' should be in the past tense form since the context of the sentence is in past situation. As a result, the correct form must be: "They lived in a small house, the grandfather earned their living by making shoes."

4.4.1.2 *Misuse of Irregular Past Tense Marker*

This problem area gains the biggest percentage among other problems areas in the tense marker subcategory. Here, there are twenty-seven cases of misuse of irregular past tense marker (44.26%). The most frequent misuse of

irregular past tense marker happens in the auxiliary 'do.' In this case, the students do not change the auxiliary 'do' into 'did' when referring to the past situation. It can be seen in data number **3.12**: "Because they <u>don't</u> have anything to give as presents reminded they were poor, so the grandmother sewed some clothes for the fairies." This data will be valid if it is changed into: "They <u>did not</u> have anything to give as presents since they were poor, so the grandmother sewed some clothes for the fairies." However, there are very limited case of errors in which the students apply the rule of English past verb (-ed endings) for the irregular past verb. This finding might mean that the cause of these errors is not because that the students do not know about the English past tense rules, but because of the lack of attention in the application of it.

4.4.1.3 *Simple Verb Used Instead of –ing*

In this problem area, the students produced the errors by using a simple verb instead of an –ing form to refer to a noun. There are three cases dealing with this category, which are data number **2.4**, **11.3** and **15.5**. In data number **2.4**: "Been an old man was not easy, but they thought to stay <u>work</u>," the student employed the simple verb 'work' instead of 'working.' It is considered to be an error since the word 'work' in this data is a gerund, and not a verb; thus, it must be followed by an –ing ending. The sentence is corrected into: "Being an old man was not easy, but they though to keep on <u>working</u>." It is important to notice that, in English, the verb comes after a preposition must be changed into an –ing form. Furthermore, the same situation also occurs in data number **11.3** and **15.5**, in which the student used the word '<u>walk</u>' instead of '<u>walking</u>,' and the word '<u>give</u>' instead of '<u>giving</u>.'

4.4.1.4 *Past Verb Used Instead of –ing*

This category deals with the misuse of –ing form, in the sense that the –ing form is replaced with past verb form in referring to noun. There are three occurrences of errors included in this category that are found in data number **2.4**, **2.20**, and **10.16**. First of all, in data number **2.4**: "<u>Been</u> an old man was not easy,

but they thought to stay work," the student misused the word 'being' by using a past participle form 'been.' Therefore, this sentence must be corrected into: "Being an old man was not easy, but they thought to keep on working."

Another example of the misuse of –ing form exists in data number **2.20**: "So they could sell and had enough money for lived." The word 'lived' which comes after the preposition 'for' should be in the form of a gerund or an –ing form. As a result, the correct pattern for this sentence is: "So they could sell the shoes and had enough money for living."

Last of all, this kind of problem also occurred in data number **10.16**: "After helped the old shoe-maker and his wife, the fairies went back to their place." In this sentence, the word 'helped' that followed the preposition 'after' must be in an –ing form. Thus, the valid form for this sentence is: "After helping the old shoemaker and his wife, the fairies went back to their place."

4.4.1.5 *Replacement of –ing in Progressive Form with Simple Verb Form*

There is only one case of replacement of –ing form in progressive form with simple verb form found in the data. In this case, the student used a simple verb form, instead of an –ing form, in the progressive tense form. This error is clearly presented in data number **8.8**: "And he very happy, so that he and his wife made the small clothes for that fairies, because the fairies were not use clothes." Actually, there are two kinds of corrections that can be applied in handling this problem such as, first, change the simple verb 'use' with the –ing form, and second, keep on using the simple verb form and change the 'to be' (were) into auxiliary do (past tense: did). Thus, the correct sentence may be: "And he was very happy, so that he and his wife made some small clothes for those fairies, because the fairies were not using (wearing) clothes" or "And he was very happy, so that he and his wife made some small clothes for those fairies, because the fairies did not use (wear) any clothes."

4.4.1.6 *Replacement of –ing in Progressive Form with Past Verb Form*

The problem of replacement of –ing with past verb form in progressive form happens only once in data (1.64%). This problem occurs because the student

use a past form, and not an –ing form, in dealing with progressive form. This problem can be seen in data number **7.17**: "Finally, the old man found many small people <u>were gathered</u> in the shoes." The pattern of 'to be' + past verb (past participle) only happens in the passive form, and not in the active form as stated in the sentence. In case if the student wants to use a past verb form, the 'to be' (were) must be omitted. As a result, the data must be corrected by substituting the past verb form with a progressive verb. The result of the correction is seen as: "Finally, the old man found many small people <u>were gathering</u> around the shoes."

4.4.1.7 *Disagreement of Verb in 'to- infinitive"*

The last problem area found in the tense marker subcategory is related to the disagreement of verb in 'to infinitive,' which contributes for 8.2%. As a matter of fact, the student mostly substitutes the simple verb form following the 'to-infinitive' with past verb form. One of the examples of this problem can be observed in data number **2.19**: "Because they could help the old man and his wife <u>to made</u> lot of shoes." Based on this data, the past verb 'made' must be changed into a simple verb 'make' in order to correct the sentence. Thus, the correct sentence will be: "because they could help the old man and his wife <u>to make</u> lot of shoes."

4.4.2 Errors in Plural Marker

Another subcategory of morphological category is the plural marker subcategory. In the use of plural marker, the students committed fifty-nine of deviant forms that accounting for 20.49% of all the total errors found in the data. As stated in the morphological category, in particular, the errors in plural marker contributes for 49.17%. In this case, the errors in plural marker include twenty-seven cases of the substitution of singulars for plurals (45.76%), and thirty-two cases of the substitution of plurals for singulars (54.24%). A clear picture of the calculation of this subcategory is presented in the table below:

Table 19: Plural Marker Subcategory

No.	Errors in Plural Marker	Number of	Percentage

		Errors	
1.	Substitution of singulars for plurals	**27**	**45.76**
2.	Substitution of plurals for singulars	**32**	**54.24**
	TOTAL	**59**	**100**

4.4.2.1 *Substitution of Singulars for Plurals*

The most common substitution of singulars for plurals exists in the word 'fairy.' There are fourteen errors occurred in the use of the word 'fairy' caused by the substitution of singulars for plurals. It is clearly shown in data number **3.10**: "And apparently, there were <u>some little fairy</u> was helping them by making beautiful shoes for them." This sentence contains of an error, in the sense that it applies singular term (fairy) for plural term. Thus, the sentence must be corrected into: "And apparently, there were <u>some little fairies</u> were helping them by making beautiful shoes for them."

Another frequent error of this category happens in the word 'shoe,' in which the students sometimes employed the singular term (shoe) in referring to a plural context. Data number **3.6**: "And someday in the morning, when he woke up, he found <u>a pair of shoe</u> in his table" is also classified as an error due to the misuse of singular noun for plural noun. In this example, the phrase 'a pair of' signals that the plurality of the following noun is required; therefore, the singular noun 'shoe' must be changed into plural noun 'shoes.' Consequently, the appropriate sentence is: "And one day in the morning, when he woke up, he found <u>a pair of shoes</u> on his table."

4.4.2.2 *Substitution of Plurals for Singulars*

In this category, the majority of the errors, twenty-six out of thirty-two errors, happen in the word 'shoemaker.' According to the data, the students often construct the word 'shoesmaker' instead of 'shoemaker.' The example of this error can be observed in data number **2.5**: "The man was worked as a Mr. <u>Shoesmaker</u>." In fact, in English, if two words are put together into one construction, usually the first word must be put in singular form, such as coffeemaker (not coffeesmaker), toothpaste (not teethpaste), and so forth. As a

result, the use of plurals for singulars in this sentence must also be corrected. The correct sentence will be: "The man worked as Mr. <u>Shoemaker</u>." The same kind of error occurs in the word 'shoe store,' in which the students used the plural term, and not the singular tem. One of the examples of this error is shown in data number **13.1**: "Once upon a time there was an old man who had a <u>shoes store</u>." The sentence will improve if it is changed into: "Once upon a time, there was an old man who had a <u>shoe store</u>."

Based on the findings and the discussion above, it can be concluded that the most frequent type of errors produced by the students of Writing I is the morphological category. Nevertheless, the syntactic category also contributes for a high percentage of errors. These findings mean that the errors committed by the students are mostly related to the use of Standard English grammar. And, it is acceptable to say that although the students still have a limited number of vocabularies, they do not really face a lot of difficulties in choosing the right word for a particular situation. As a consequence, the lexical category does not count for a big percentage.